

# **Winooski River Basin Clean Water Service Provider**

Date: 14 October 2024

To: Winooski Basin Water Quality Council

Re: Winooski Basin Clean Water Service Provider Staff recommendation for project prioritization & funding

This memo offers funding recommendations for the following four<sup>1</sup> proposals:

1. Friends of the Winooski River – GMC & VTACT Riparian Buffer Planting
2. Friends of the Winooski River – Graber Riparian Buffer Planting
3. Friends of the Winooski River – SHO Riparian Buffer Planting
4. Friends of the Winooski River – Tyler Place Trib Riparian Buffer Planting

Project development proposals were evaluated on the likelihood of successfully identifying water quality restoration projects that can be advanced through implementation using Formula Grant funds. Design- and Implementation-phase proposals were evaluated using the following criteria: Cost effectiveness of phosphorous reduction (75 points), Project Risk (10 points), Design Life (5 points) and Co-benefits (10 points).

For a more detailed description of the Design- and Implementation-phase project proposal review process, refer to the [Co-benefits scoring methodology](#), the March 2023 Clean Water Service Provider [presentation](#) to the Winooski Basin Water Quality Council and the [minutes](#) from that meeting. Assessment / Identification and Development-phase projects are scored according to their likelihood of success in identifying cost-efficient, non-regulatory water quality improvement projects in the Winooski Basin.

## **Funding Recommendations**

- 1. Friends of the Winooski River – GMC & VTACT Riparian Buffer Planting:** This proposal seeks funding to implement a riparian buffer planting on 2 acres in the Lower Little River Watershed (Waterbury). The landowner supports this project, but no Operations & Maintenance Plan has been signed. The expected phosphorous reduction for this project is

---

<sup>1</sup> NOTE: Friends of the Winooski River submitted five funding request proposals prior to the September 2025 meeting. One of the proposals (Kelly Riparian Buffer Planting) has been retracted due to a pending sale of the property.

1.5 kg / yr. At \$10,365 / kg p, this project is considered cost-efficient. The total project score of 72.65 is acceptable for an Implementation-phase project. **Recommendation: prioritize this funding request.**

**Table 1-1: Cost-Effectiveness Score**

Criteria	Value
Funding Request	\$15,548
Future Funding Request	\$0
Total Cost	\$15,548
Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr)	1.5
Design Life	15
Cost Effectiveness (\$ / kg)	\$10,365
<b>Cost-Effectiveness Score</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>Cost Effectiveness Formula (\$ / kg / yr) = ((15 years / project design life) * (Total Cost)) / (Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr))</b>	
<b>Maximum Implementation-phase Cost-Effectiveness Score = 75 points</b>	

**Table 1-2: Project Risk Score**

Risk Category	Points
Landowner Relations	2.5
Organizational Capacity	2.5
Operations & Maintenance	0
Permitting	2.5
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>7.5</b>
<b>Maximum Total Score = 10 points</b>	

**Table 1-3: Co-benefits Score**

Co-benefit	Score	Weight	Weighted Score
Environmental Justice	0	17.78%	0
Income	0		
Race	0		
Language	0		
Ecological Benefits	4.5	30.44%	1.3698
Listed / Impaired Water Resource	3		
Priority Water Resource	1.5		
Habitat & Species Enhancement	0		
Ecosystem Services	10	23.78%	2.378
Flood Regulation	5		
Carbon Sequestration	5		
Community Building	5	15.78%	0.789
Community Involvement	1		
Working Landscape	0		
Recreation	4		
Education	5	12.22%	0.611
Interpretive Signage	5		
Meetings & Workshops	0		
Total Co-benefits Score 5.1478			

<b>Maximum Weighted Score = 10 points</b>
---

**Table 1-4: Total Project Score**

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Score</b>
Cost-Effectiveness Score	55
Project Risk Score	7.5
Design Life Score	5
Co-benefits Score	5.1478
<b>Total Project Score</b>	<b>72.65</b>

## 2. Friends of the Winooski River – Graber Riparian Buffer

**Planting:** This proposal seeks funding to implement a riparian buffer planting on 0.85 acres in the Winooski River Headwaters Watershed (Cabot). The landowner supports this project, but no Operations & Maintenance Plan has been signed. The expected phosphorous reduction for this project is 1.7 kg / yr. At \$6,562 / kg p, this project is considered cost-efficient. The total project score of 91.7 is high for an Implementation-phase project. **Recommendation: prioritize this funding request.**

**Table 2-1: Cost-Effectiveness Score**

Criteria	Value
Funding Request	\$11,155
Future Funding Request	\$0
Total Cost	\$11,155
Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr)	1.7
Design Life	15
Cost Effectiveness (\$ / kg)	\$6,562
<b>Cost-Effectiveness Score</b>	75
<b>Cost Effectiveness Formula (\$ / kg / yr) = ((15 years / project design life) * (Total Cost)) / (Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr))</b>	

**Maximum Implementation-phase  
Cost-Effectiveness Score = 75 points**

**Table 2-2: Project Risk Score**

Risk Category	Points
Landowner Relations	2.5
Organizational Capacity	2.5
Operations & Maintenance	0
Permitting	2.5
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>7.5</b>

**Maximum Total Score = 10 points**

**Table 2-3: Co-benefits Score**

Co-benefit	Score	Weight	Weighted Score
Environmental Justice	0	17.78%	0
Income	0		
Race	0		
Language	0		
Ecological Benefits	6	30.44%	1.8264
Listed / Impaired Water Resource	3		
Priority Water Resource	3		
Habitat & Species Enhancement	0		
Ecosystem Services	10	23.78%	2.378
Flood Regulation	5		
Carbon Sequestration	5		
Community Building	0	15.78%	0
Community Involvement	0		
Working Landscape	0		
Recreation	0		
Education	0	12.22%	0
Interpretive Signage	0		
Meetings & Workshops	0		
Total Co-benefits Score 4.2044			

<b>Maximum Weighted Score = 10 points</b>
---

**Table 2-4: Total Project Score**

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Score</b>
Cost-Effectiveness Score	75
Project Risk Score	7.5
Design Life Score	5
Co-benefits Score	4.2044
<b>Total Project Score</b>	<b>91.70</b>

### 3. Friends of the Winooski River – SHO Riparian Buffer Planting:

This proposal seeks funding to implement a riparian buffer planting on 1.75 acres in the Huntington River Watershed (Huntington). The landowners support this project, but no Operations & Maintenance Plan has been signed. The expected phosphorous reduction for this project is 1.1 kg / yr. At \$12,673 / kg p, this project is considered cost-efficient. The total project score of 60.04 is acceptable for an Implementation-phase project. **Recommendation: prioritize this funding request.**

**Table 3-1: Cost-Effectiveness Score**

Criteria	Value
Funding Request	\$13,940
Future Funding Request	\$0
Total Cost	\$13,940
Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr)	1.1
Design Life	15
Cost Effectiveness (\$ / kg)	\$12,673
<b>Cost-Effectiveness Score</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>Cost Effectiveness Formula (\$ / kg / yr) = ((15 years / project design life) * (Total Cost)) / (Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr))</b>	

<b>Maximum Implementation-phase Cost-Effectiveness Score = 75 points</b>
--

**Table 3-2: Project Risk Score**

Risk Category	Points
Landowner Relations	2.5
Organizational Capacity	2.5
Operations & Maintenance	0
Permitting	2.5
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>7.5</b>

<b>Maximum Total Score = 10 points</b>
--

**Table 3-3: Co-benefits Score**

Co-benefit	Score	Weight	Weighted Score
Environmental Justice	0	17.78%	0
Income	0		
Race	0		
Language	0		
Ecological Benefits	0	30.44%	0
Listed / Impaired Water Resource	0		
Priority Water Resource	0		
Habitat & Species Enhancement	0		
Ecosystem Services	10	23.78%	2.378
Flood Regulation	5		
Carbon Sequestration	5		
Community Building	1	15.78%	0.1578
Community Involvement	1		
Working Landscape	0		
Recreation	0		
Education	0	12.22%	0
Interpretive Signage	0		
Meetings & Workshops	0		
Total Co-benefits Score 2.5358			

<b>Maximum Weighted Score = 10 points</b>
---

**Table 3-4: Total Project Score**

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Score</b>
Cost-Effectiveness Score	45
Project Risk Score	7.5
Design Life Score	5
Co-benefits Score	2.5358
<b>Total Project Score</b>	<b>60.04</b>

#### 4. Friends of the Winooski River – Tyler Place Trib Riparian Buffer

**Planting:** This proposal seeks funding to implement a riparian buffer planting on 3.75 acres along a tributary to the Winooski River. The landowner supports this project, but no Operations & Maintenance Plan has been signed. The expected phosphorous reduction for this project is 3.25 kg / yr. At \$6,819 / kg p, this project is considered cost-efficient. The total project score of 90.51 is high for an Implementation-phase project. **Recommendation: prioritize this funding request.**

**Table 4-1: Cost-Effectiveness Score**

Criteria	Value
Funding Request	\$25,572
Future Funding Request	\$0
Total Cost	\$25,572
Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr)	3.75
Design Life	15
Cost Effectiveness (\$ / kg)	\$6,819
<b>Cost-Effectiveness Score</b>	<b>75</b>
<b>Cost Effectiveness Formula (\$ / kg / yr) = ((15 years / project design life) * (Total Cost)) / (Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr))</b>	

**Maximum Implementation-phase  
Cost-Effectiveness Score = 75 points**

**Table 4-2: Project Risk Score**

Risk Category	Points
Landowner Relations	2.5
Organizational Capacity	2.5
Operations & Maintenance	0
Permitting	2.5
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>7.5</b>

**Maximum Total Score = 10 points**

**Table 4-3: Co-benefits Score**

Co-benefit	Score	Weight	Weighted Score
Environmental Justice	0	17.78%	0
Income	0		
Race	0		
Language	0		
Ecological Benefits	0	30.44%	0
Listed / Impaired Water Resource	0		
Priority Water Resource	0		
Habitat & Species Enhancement	0		
Ecosystem Services	10	23.78%	2.378
Flood Regulation	5		
Carbon Sequestration	5		
Community Building	4	15.78%	0.6312
Community Involvement	2		
Working Landscape	0		
Recreation	2		
Education	0	12.22%	0
Interpretive Signage	0		
Meetings & Workshops	0		
Total Co-benefits Score 3.0092			

<b>Maximum Weighted Score = 10 points</b>
---

**Table 4-4: Total Project Score**

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Score</b>
Cost-Effectiveness Score	75
Project Risk Score	7.5
Design Life Score	5
Co-benefits Score	3.0092
<b>Total Project Score</b>	<b>90.51</b>