

# Winooski River Basin Clean Water Service Provider

Date: 16 March 2026

To: Winooski Basin Water Quality Council

Re: Winooski Basin Clean Water Service Provider Staff recommendation for project prioritization & funding

This memo offers funding recommendations for the following proposal:

1. [Central Vermont Regional Planning Commission – Preliminary Design – McCarty Road Culvert Replacement](#)
2. [Winooski Natural Resources Conservation District – Project Development – Basin & Riparian Buffer Planting Adoptions](#)

Project development proposals were evaluated on the likelihood of successfully identifying water quality restoration projects that can be advanced through implementation using Formula Grant funds. Design- and Implementation-phase proposals were evaluated using the following criteria: Cost effectiveness of phosphorous reduction (75 points), Project Risk (10 points), Design Life (5 points) and Co-benefits (10 points).

For a more detailed description of the Design- and Implementation-phase project proposal review process, refer to the [Co-benefits scoring methodology](#), the March 2023 Clean Water Service Provider [presentation](#) to the Winooski Basin Water Quality Council and the [minutes](#) from that meeting. Assessment / Identification and Development-phase projects are scored according to their likelihood of success in identifying cost-efficient, non-regulatory water quality improvement projects in the Winooski Basin.

## Funding Recommendations

- 1. Central Vermont Regional Planning Commission – Preliminary Design – McCarty Road Culvert Replacement:** This proposal seeks funding to complete a Preliminary Design for the replacement of a culvert on McCarty Road and four privately owned structures located upstream from the culvert. The Town Selectboard, Conservation Commission and adjacent landowner support this project. The preliminary phosphorous reduction and future funding request estimates for this project are 16 kg / yr and \$400,000. However, the Implementation Cost is a conservative cost estimate that is expected to decrease based on information developed during the Preliminary Design phase. Additionally, if the cost-

efficiency rate remains above the cost threshold, matching funds will be requested from the town to reduce overall project cost. The total project score of 10.55 is low for a Preliminary Design-phase project.

**Recommendation: prioritize this funding request.**

**Table 1-1: Cost-Effectiveness Score**

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Value</b>
Funding Request	\$48,259
Future Funding Request	\$400,000
Total Cost	\$448,259
Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr)	16
Design Life	10
Cost Effectiveness (\$ / kg)	\$42,024
<b>Cost-Effectiveness Score</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Cost Effectiveness Formula (\$ / kg / yr) = ((15 years / project design life) * (Total Cost)) / (Phosphorous Reduction (kg / yr))</b>	

<b>Maximum Implementation-phase Cost-Effectiveness Score = 75 points</b>
--

**Table 1-2: Project Risk Score**

<b>Risk Category</b>	<b>Points</b>
Landowner Relations	2.5
Organizational Capacity	2.5
Operations & Maintenance	0
Permitting	2.5
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>7.5</b>

<b>Maximum Total Score = 10 points</b>
--

**Table 1-3: Co-benefits Score**

<b>Co-benefit</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Weight</b>	<b>Weighted Score</b>
<b>Environmental Justice</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>17.78%</b>	<b>0</b>
Income	0		
Race	0		
Language	0		
<b>Ecological Benefits</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>30.44%</b>	<b>0.9132</b>
Listed / Impaired Water Resource	0		
Priority Water Resource	0		
Habitat & Species Enhancement	0		
<b>Ecosystem Services</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>23.78%</b>	<b>1.189</b>
Flood Regulation	5		
Carbon Sequestration	0		
<b>Community Building</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>15.78%</b>	<b>0.9468</b>
Community Involvement	0		
Working Landscape	3		
Recreation	0		
<b>Education</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>12.22%</b>	<b>0</b>
Interpretive Signage	0		
Meetings & Workshops	0		
<b>Total Co-benefits Score 3.049</b>			

<b>Maximum Weighted Score = 10 points</b>
---

**Table 1-4: Total Project Score**

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>Score</b>
Cost-Effectiveness Score	0
Project Risk Score	7.5
Design Life Score	0
Co-benefits Score	3.049
<b>Total Project Score</b>	<b>10.55</b>

**2. Winooski Natural Resources Conservation District – Project Development – Basin 8 Riparian Buffer Planting Adoptions:** This proposal seeks funding to evaluate the condition of five existing riparian

buffer planting implemented by the WNRCD over the past decade. The result of this effort will be the identification of projects that have landowners willing to continue hosting a riparian buffer planting and updated p-reduction estimates (using the current phosphorous accounting methodology). **Recommendation: prioritize this funding request.**